

## **HASKAYNE SCHOOL OF BUSINESS UNIT REVIEW**

### **Summary Report**

The Site Visit of the Unit Review Team for the Haskayne School of Business took place from March 25-26, 2019. The Unit Review Team consisted of:

Dr. Mike Fishman, Northwestern University  
Dr. Michael Benarroch, Ryerson University  
Dr. Kin Lo, University of British Columbia  
Dr. Qiao Sun, University of Calgary

Following the Site Visit, the three external members of the Unit Review Team prepared a written report containing their comments and recommendations. The Haskayne School of Business subsequently provided responses to the recommendations. General comments and the recommendations and responses follow.

### **General Comments of the Unit Review Team**

---

The Haskayne School of Business appears to be a healthy organization. The students, administrators, and faculty are happy with respect to the way the school is run. While members of all three groups have feedback, they clearly state that they are happy to be at Haskayne. Based on peoples' comments, we believe that Dean Jim Dewald and his team have done a great job in building and/or sustaining this healthy organization. We would also say that alumni and members of the local business community are also happy with Haskayne (maybe among the local business community we met were also alumni).

The other deans view Haskayne as an integral part of the University of Calgary. Haskayne is not aloof as are some business schools and they participate toward the common good. The other Deans value stable HSB leadership and they noted that things were problematic before Dean Dewald. The deans had various ideas for further collaboration with Haskayne. While some obstacles to collaboration were mentioned, these did not seem insurmountable. We recommend that the deans work with the provost on enumerating and eliminating these obstacles.

Dean Dewald has his sights set high – make Haskayne a top-5 Canadian business school. This goal, in general terms, is the same as that stated by the University as a whole. However, there are different perspectives on how one measures “top-5.” The Dean believes that mimicking the other top business schools won’t do it given the competitive landscape and budget constraints. Rather Haskayne must chart its own path, capitalizing on the loyalty of their alumni, the Calgary business community, and the people of Calgary more generally. One way to differentiate Haskayne might be to focus more on practical research with the goal of affecting management practice instead of the goal of publishing in what are conventionally considered the top academic journals. On the other hand, the Schools’ policies in terms of the “Eyes High” list of journals and its hiring, tenure, and promotion practices are more aligned with the traditional measures of research output and impact. Another way to differentiate Haskayne might be to become excellent (with the full meaning of that word) in some

particular area of great importance. One possibility mentioned was Sustainability. Could Haskayne become a hub that fosters Calgary's entrepreneurial spirit to take on one of the most important issues of our time? Doing well by doing good?

The City of Calgary is at a critical juncture in terms of its economic development and that the University of Calgary and Haskayne could be influential in determining the city's direction. A comment here on Calgary and Haskayne. We do not have the figures but we assume that a relatively large fraction of students come from Calgary and Alberta more generally, and stay in Calgary upon graduation. (If we are wrong you may dismiss this comment now.) Is that the demographic of a top business school? Being top 5 may require luring students from a broader geography. But this might be difficult. Will students come to Calgary knowing that the network they develop will be heavily weighted toward people in Calgary? Maybe it would be worth investing some effort in recruiting more students from outside of Alberta. International students will be discussed later in this report but it is worth noting that they might also help with the issue here. Of course, maybe it wouldn't be difficult to lure students from afar if Haskayne delivers on becoming excellent in some area of great importance (see our remark above).

The new building project is a source of great excitement. Everyone who came into that classroom inspected the drawings. It goes without saying (but we'll say it anyway), take advantage of this rare time in the school's history. As someone said, "tap into the energy of the new building." If more staff are needed to engage alumni and donors then pulling from elsewhere (if necessary) sounds like a good tradeoff.

## Reviewer Recommendations and Unit Response Follow-up

---

### DEPARTMENT STRUCTURE

***Recommendation 1: Greater transparency and direction are required with respect to the DBA and Master in Management. In particular, Chairs must be consulted on teaching assignments and program schedules.***

#### **Faculty Response:**

Agreed. The challenge of respecting program director and Area Chair responsibilities will be formalized through processes that require approval from each (i.e. a written form versus reliance on informal conversations).

### NEW PROGRAMS AND PROGRAM MIX

***Recommendation 2: The Haskayne School should reduce the number of concentrations at the undergraduate level and focus on a smaller number of concentrations for which it can offer world-class programming.***

**Faculty Response:**

This discussion will be brought to the Undergraduate Review Committee to determine the feasibility of combining concentrations into larger 'pools' of courses offered by the areas. Other considerations include reviews with:

1. Employers/ industry representative to assess the desirability of students graduating with a broader specialization versus a narrow concentration designation on the student's transcript. For example, with advisory input from industry, the Petroleum Land Management and Energy Management concentrations were combined and replaced with pathways for students entering different industries. It would be advisable to look at the impact that combination has made a year or two after the amalgamation.
2. Other university business programs to compare the breadth and depth of concentrations.
3. Recruiters in order to determine the importance (to students/parents) of being able to select a concentration before taking introductory courses in the field. What is more appealing: a broad concentration or a focused 6-course field of study?
4. Accreditation bodies attached to several of our concentrations (BTMA, OBHR, SCMA) to determine the impact of broader concentrations on the accreditation status of our concentrations.
5. Faculty and industry representatives to propose suggested 'pathways' for students wishing to specialize within a given concentration

In addition, we will continue to look at the registration trends in required concentration courses. Those concentrations that have frequently lower enrollments, with little uptake from students should be the first to be considered as candidates for amalgamation with similar areas. We monitor and cancel any sections that do not meet our break-even minimum.

**BUDGET**

***Recommendation 3: Continue to develop revenue-generating programs but be mindful of full costs of program delivery and administration.***

**Faculty Response:**

With the shift to new tuition-based budget modeling, this recommendation fits with the drive for greater transparency and matching of resources to student and employer demands. Budget tools are being developed to identify break-even and marginal benefit values based on full cost accounting.

***Recommendation 4: Be prepared to discontinue non-core programs if they do not generate resources.***

**Faculty Response:**

Agreed. Given the monitoring tools that are being created it will be easy to monitor if programs are not generating resources, and to take the appropriate steps to close or improve programs.

***Recommendation 5: The University should be mindful that the RCM model creates not only incentives for Faculties to be competitive with other universities, but also the potential for competition or conflict***

***within the University when two or more Faculties wish to extract revenues from the same market of potential students.***

**Faculty Response:**

The comment is noted.

**COMPOSITION OF ACADEMIC STAFF**

***Recommendation 6: Increase the research faculty complement so that the proportion of teaching faculty declines significantly from the current level of one-third.***

**Faculty Response:**

This has been the subject of extensive conversation and the leadership team endorse this recommendation. However, it will be necessary to improve the schools financial resources to have a significant impact on the shift to more research oriented faculty. We expect that the new tuition based funding model will support this need.

***Recommendation 7: Ensure compliance with accreditation requirements for faculty qualifications.***

**Faculty Response:**

The school has met its accreditation requirements for faculty qualifications at the recent AACSB review, and this will be monitored annually to ensure continued compliance. A review of the recent merit submissions indicates that we continue to meet our accreditation requirements.

**RESEARCH**

***Recommendation 8: Ensure that the reward system for research productivity defines quality broadly but transparently so that it is fair to all faculty members.***

**Faculty Response:**

This is a challenge many business schools face, and our approach is to have Faculty Council adopt journal lists, which most recently occurred in May 2019 (after the review was completed). The vote was well supported as a compromise, knowing that a smaller faction of faculty would prefer a broader list while others prefer a narrower list.

***Recommendation 9: Focus reward system on high quality research outputs.***

**Faculty Response:**

Agreed. The academic research reward system is focused on the highest quality research outputs, including the best journals in business/management.

***Recommendation 10: Consult with faculty to identify areas of research focus to inform hiring and retention plans.***

**Faculty Response:**

Area Chairs are requested to present a case for research hires, based on the criteria of first covering basic needs (which is not generally a concern), and secondly excelling in areas of specific strength or important areas for expansion. The consideration of expanding this to include a full faculty discussion will be put on the agenda of a Faculty Council meeting.

***Recommendation 11: Develop additional funds to invest in retaining productive young faculty.***

**Faculty Response:**

The School has recruited excellent research faculty, and retention has been above historic levels and at an acceptable, if not exceptional level. Recognizing the competitive landscape within which we operate, we will continue to monitor our position.

***Recommendation 12: Consider research faculty mentoring. Create a way for the research stars to share some tips and insights with the rest of the faculty.***

**Faculty Response:**

HSB will implement a formal research mentoring system during the academic year 2019-2020. Every newly minted assistant professor will be assigned a research mentor and the Associate Dean (Research) will have regular joint meetings with the mentee and the mentor. In addition, the ADR will organize junior faculty research lunches (one per semester) where untenured faculty will be able to talk about important research issues in an informal and confidential setting. Lastly, Dr. Bob Hinings (professor emeritus from University of Alberta) is playing a significant role as Senior Research Mentor at HSB.

**PHD PROGRAM**

***Recommendation 13: Grow the number of students in the PhD program to ensure that a sufficient number of PhD students enter in each field in a given year to guarantee that courses can be offered in the field. Alternatively, if resource constraints limit the number of students in the program, rotate enrolments over time and across the disciplines to ensure that a sufficient number of students are accepted in a given discipline so that students' PhD- level field courses can be offered at Haskayne.***

**Faculty Response:**

This is an excellent recommendation. There are a number of positive outcomes associated with an increased growth in PhD students. Over the last eight years the number of students accepted in the PhD program has ranged from 6 to 10, although funding has been available for 12. The goal has always been to create cohorts, unfortunately the random nature of applications has limited the ability to rotate or bunch acceptances according to a discipline. We will continue to work towards this goal, and to increasing the number of students registered in the doctoral program.

***Recommendation 14: Consider adding shared offices for upper level students. Given potential space constraints, this could be considered in the planning for the new building.***

**Faculty Response:**

Space constraints do not allow us to consider this recommendation in Scurfield Hall but we will consider it (for candidate PhD students) with the forthcoming building of Mathison Hall and renovation of Scurfield Hall.

***Recommendation 15: Consider shared course/classes across graduate programs in areas where the cohort size is below three students (MBA, DBA and PhD). Joint PhD/Master's classes can assign differential learning outcomes and course work for PhD students relative to Master's students.***

**Faculty Response:**

Where possible, this will be done. Other than the PhD program, where this is common, it is a rare problem in our course-based programming. Although the topic may be of interest, research intensive PhD courses often do not fit the needs for MBA or DBA students. What has been done effectively is sharing PhD courses with other faculties and even other schools (i.e. University of Alberta).

***Recommendation 16: Develop research-based MSC program as feeder to the PhD program.***

**Faculty Response:**

The School offers a thesis MBA, which has minimal registrations (for instance 1 student per year). Research will be needed to determine the market interest and financial viability of an MSC program. This is not seen as a high priority for the School at this time.

**CENTERS**

***Recommendation 17: Continue to evolve centers to include research and research faculty where appropriate.***

**Faculty Response:**

Agreed. This is an important goal of the School. The Canadian Centre for Advanced Leadership in Business (CCAL) is being used as a pilot learning opportunity, the Westman Centre is in a fundraising campaign to fund academic positions, and there are opportunities to more closely engage faculty members in the Hunter Centre, the Trico Centre, and the Creative Destruction Lab - Rockies.

***Recommendation 18: Secure stable long-term external funding to support the centres.***

**Faculty Response:**

Agreed. This is a significant goal that will continue to be a focus of attention. Funding plans will be developed by June 30, 2020.

***Recommendation 19: Create better connectivity between the centres, and between the centres and the rest of the HSB. Ensure that duplication of programming or contact with outside organizations/individuals is minimized.***

**Faculty Response:**

Coordination will be tightened at the senior leader level and, if necessary, a coordination committee will be established.

## COORDINATE OUTREACH

***Recommendation 20: This outreach could perhaps be better coordinated. It sounds like there are a variety of invitations to visit campus for events. Is generating attendance at some of these events more important than others? If so, do invitees know which ones are the important ones and why? Some of the alumni said that they didn't always know if they were being invited by Haskayne or some other unit of the University of Calgary. This suggests that the invitations are being deleted a little too fast.***

***It similarly appears that people are often asked to participate in the activities of Haskayne's Centres. Are the Centres acting in unison when issuing these asks? If not, they should.***

***The alumni and business people felt that Haskayne was perhaps best positioned among Calgary institutions in convening Calgary's leaders. The School should capitalize on this earned advantage. We asked if Haskayne was the only institution in Calgary that could be a great convener. The answer was no, energy trade groups were mentioned too. So, there is some competition in this regard.***

### **Faculty Response:**

This recommendation incorporates two distinct topics. With respect to better coordination and clarity on event invitations, this feedback has been shared and will the School will endeavor to provide greater consistency and clarity. The School will also continue to work with Central Administration to coordinate events and activities.

With respect to Haskayne acting as a business community convener, this is a reflection of current frustrations in Calgary and Alberta regarding a stubbornly slow economy. Since the review, the Business Council of Alberta has been formed. Having said that, the School will continue to work hard to develop a position of trust and respect with the community.

## UNDERGRADUATES

***Recommendation 21: Defer requiring students to select a concentration until the second year or beginning of the third year of their program.***

### **Faculty Response:**

There is a requirement within our systems to have a concentration listed for each student. To address the concerns heard in the review, the School will present a plan to Faculty Council whereby; (1) the term 'general' concentration will be changed to 'business', (2) new students will all be set as 'business' concentrations, and (3) students will have the ability through automated process to shift their concentration in years 2 or 3.

***Recommendation 22: Design curriculum information based on student career goals (goals to concentration to course selection).***

### **Faculty Response:**

Presently, we are working with the different areas, career and academic advisors to develop online planning tools (pathways) that will allow students to select concentration areas based on their interests and aptitudes. These pathways will allow students the opportunity to plan course selection over the

course of their degree as well as suggest suitable minors and companion business courses to complement their concentration. As the Haskayne website is being redesigned for 2019-2020, we will begin this year to incorporate these tools on our website.

## **DIVERSITY**

***Recommendation 23: The school should continue to focus on hiring women in the research stream to ensure that greater equity is achieved. To this end, the school must be transparent about this goal and ensure that all hiring committees understand the importance of achieving gender equity in hiring.***

### **Faculty Response:**

Agreed. In May, we held training for area chairs on selection and recruitment, which focused on topics related to diversity as well as specific requirements and best practices for running an effective search. We will continue recruitment efforts to balance gender equity.

***Recommendation 24: Ensure that hiring committees have balance between men and women and minimize unconscious bias in the hiring process. Consider unconscious bias training for all hiring committees.***

### **Faculty Response:**

Please see response above. In addition to implicit bias training that was delivered to all area chairs, we always ensure a gender balance on committees. We also are formalizing our hiring process this coming year such that each area will ensure that visiting faculty meet with a diverse group of people during their campus visit.

***Recommendation 25: Develop an Indigenous Strategy for the Haskayne School of Business built around the University's Indigenous Strategy.***

### **Faculty Response:**

Work is ongoing with the Vice-Provost Indigenous Strategy for the University of Calgary regarding a 'made-in-Haskayne' strategy that fits best for our school. There is intense competition for indigenous faculty in business, and the initial view is that Haskayne could have a more lasting impact by developing a strategy anchored on (1) physical impact (as part of the Mathison Hall project), and (2) education and research related to the indigenous 'world-view'.

***Recommendation 26: Offer professional development opportunities to raise awareness of Indigenous culture, reconciliation and the process of Indigenization of the Academy for the administrative team, faculty and staff at the Haskayne School.***

### **Faculty Response:**

Prior to finalizing the Haskayne Indigenous strategy, a school engagement program will be undertaken, including town halls and/or retreat and workshops to refine and if necessary alter the strategy.

## **MBA STUDENTS**

***Recommendation 27: Try to improve student internships opportunities.***



**Faculty Response:**

We have reviewed and updated the graduate career centre job profiles to incorporate business development (to put more focus on obtaining internships, summer placements and permanent placements). We are expanding the human resources capacity.

**Recommendation 28:** We do not know your procedures on such matters – but maybe students who have already taken the undergraduate versions of courses should be waived out of such courses and allowed to take electives in their place. Though not as extreme, students who studied business at other schools will presumably have similar feelings.

**Faculty Response:**

This problem has already been resolved. The accelerated MBA program allows students who have Bachelor of Commerce degrees to move straight into electives, with 3 core courses that are specifically designed for MBA students.

**Recommendation 29:** *Haskayne should take steps to improve students' classroom experience.*

**Faculty Response:**

This recommendation was within the MBA section and applies to the MBA program. Over the last few years a number of faculty development activities have been implemented with the goal of improving the classroom experience of teaching: open classroom week, teaching squares, instructional skills workshop, annual unconference, and monthly lunch and learn workshops. There has been an increased attendance at these activities as more faculty are showing interest in improving their course design and delivery. In the past year, the lunch and learn activities have included topics such as; design thinking in the classroom, use of a partial information exercises (PIE) to improve student engagement, and students as partners in course design, and engaging students in experiential exercises. Some of the dissatisfaction noted by MBA students had to do with the overlap between core courses and prior work that they had done as undergraduates. The introduction of the accelerated MBA should alleviate this problem.

**TEACHING FACULTY**

**Recommendation 30:** *If there is not already, there should be a clearly articulated process for teaching faculty to be considered for promotion.*

**Faculty Response:**

The specific concern is that promotion guidelines for faculty members are very research focused, even for Instructors. Guidelines will be updated in 2020-21.

**OPPORTUNITIES TO IMPROVE THE SCHOOL**

**Recommendation 31:** *An immediate need of the school and one that will have a strong impact on the future ranking of the school is the hiring of additional research faculty.*

**Faculty Response:**

See recommendation #6

***Recommendation 32: Articulate clearly the need to publish in high quality journals and create a standard within the school for meeting these expectations.***

**Faculty Response:**

Most of the elements are already in place (or will be by July 1, 2019). Once HSB is given the permission to start updating the guidelines for Promotion and Tenure, the guidelines will be updated so that they are fully aligned with research excellency. Clear messaging and communications will be essential in strengthening culture of excellency.

***Recommendation 33: Focus research in the school around a small number of research clusters striving for excellence. The current strengths of the school appear to be OB/HR, Leadership, Corporate Social Responsibility, International Business, and Business Analytics. In addition, Entrepreneurship is a focus of teaching and programming but it is not one of the research specializations. Haskayne seems well placed to take advantage of this opportunity in terms of programming, though would likely need several years to hire world class faculty.***

**Faculty Response:**

This is an important recommendation that will be taken under advisement. There are pros and cons to this strategy. Specifically, the school currently has a culture of collegiality and collaboration, and there is a risk picking favourites, while concentrating resources (bigger bang for the buck) might cause a sense of winners and losers.

***Recommendation 34: Build one of the centres at the HSB into a world class centre, known Internationally for its research expertise and student programming. The two centres with the greatest potential appear to be the Canadian Centre for Advanced Leadership in Business or the Hunter Centre for Entrepreneurship and Innovation. This Centre should include world class researchers and dynamic/unique student programming.***

**Faculty Response:**

This recommendation is very much on track with the plans for CCAL. Resources and focus are targeted at growing the Centre to a much higher place and having a more substantial role in fostering research. Having said that, leadership is very common for business schools, and it will be hard to achieve world-class standing.

## Follow-up

---

The Review Team recommendations will be revisited mid-way through the cycle. At that point, the Haskayne School of Business will be required to report on its status in acting on the recommendations, providing explanations and timelines for those which have not been met. This interim report should be submitted to the Provost in September 2021, with the next full review scheduled in 2023-2024.